

## Summary of the mains results of the evaluation reports of the four DFID funded projects on informal economy

### Introductory notes.

The following document is a summary of the final evaluation reports of four DFID funded informal economy projects. These projects are: Employment creation in Municipal Services delivery in **Eastern Africa** – Improving the living conditions and providing jobs for the poor, Políticas de erradicación de la pobreza , generación de empleo y promoción de la igualdad de género dirigidas al sector informal en **América Latina**, Reducing poverty by Promoting Employment of youth and Other Vulnerable Groups in the Informal Economy of **Central Asia and Caucasus** and Poverty, Employment in **Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand**.

The various questions used to regroup the information were sent to the project management team in June 2006.. As the aim of this report is to synthesize the voluminous and insightful project evaluation reports, it may be possible that, reading through the complete evaluation reports, some information was left out. In all cases, the complete evaluation reports will provide complete information.

| 1. Which were the <u>main goals</u> of the project? Please specify if different than in the original project document and if so, why?                     |  |
|---|--|
| Employment creation in Municipal Services delivery in <b>Eastern Africa</b> – Improving the living conditions and providing jobs for the poor.            | Kenya, Somalia, Tanzania, Uganda<br>January 2004/June 2006),<br>Reduced Poverty (through creation of decent jobs, income generation and enterprise development in the informal economy)  |
| Políticas de erradicación de la pobreza , generación de empleo y promoción de la igualdad de género dirigidas al sector informal en <b>América Latina</b> | Brazil and Ecuador<br>June 2003/June 2006<br>In <b>Brazil</b> , the objective of the project has been to promote the introduction of racial and gender dimensions in public policies focussing on reducing poverty and increasing job creation. Aimed at facilitating the insertion of women and black people into the labour force and in so doing, it aimed at generating incomes in order to reduce poverty, reduce social inequalities, inequalities related to gender and race. |
| Reducing poverty  | Azerbaijan, Georgia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan  |

|  |  |
|--|--|
| by Promoting Employment of youth and Other Vulnerable Groups in the Informal Economy of <b>Central Asia and Caucasus</b> | January 2004/May 2006  |
| Poverty, Employment in <b>Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand</b>  | <p>Cambodia, Mongolia and Thailand<br/>August 2005 to June 2006</p> <p>The project sought to create strategies to support national policies in order that the policies are made more responsive to the reality faced by informal economy workers and that policies are felt in the day-to-day lives of working people.</p> <p>The project also took to work on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- strengthening internal capacities of informal units, both individually and collectively, so that they could engage institutional mechanisms governing access to resources and protection.</li> <li>- adapting and reforming policies and institutional mechanisms so that they could apply and benefit the growing labour force found outside of the traditional work setting.</li> </ul> |

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

|                |   |
|----------------|---|
| Eastern Africa | <p>Partly accomplished the following immediate objective of the programme.</p> <p><b>The Immediate Objective/Outcome: Increased decent employment and improved living and working conditions for the urban poor.</b></p> <p>With the short timeframe of the programme implementation of two years the programme was able to accomplish the following outputs, which subsequently in a long run can produce the desired outcome above; the accomplished outputs are:</p> <p><b>1) Adapted versions of the ILO training guide on local employment in the Informal Economy (IE) developed and local trainers trained to use in the participatory and inclusive decision making process to identify potential partners and how best to involve them in service delivery for the poor.</b> More than 300</p> |
|----------------|---|

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

municipal staff and other stakeholders have been trained using the locally adapted training materials on Support to Informal Economy. During the training many issues were identified as hindrance to development of informal economy, which is a key provider of employment opportunities to youth and women. Some of the municipal authorities have started to take steps to address the constraints such as organizing the Informal operators for easy accessibility to required support, providing them with operation space and recognizing them as the contributors to the economic growth.

**2) Inclusive Procurement systems (including contract documents and cost recovery mechanisms) developed to support the participating target group in service delivery-** Elements of pro-poor procurement systems including sample of contracts have been established and more than 300 municipal staff from six municipal authorities in Tanzania have been trained in pro-poor contracting systems.

**3) Participatory M&E systems with indicators related to poverty, environment, and decent work employment developed and in use at the project, and municipal levels.** M&E systems for the programme put in place including tools, Municipal authorities have been facilitated to improve and strengthen their M&E systems with tools and indicators to monitor issues of employment, OSH and decent work. Technical committees established in each municipality to monitor the service delivery process.

**4) Training courses on waste collection and recycling enterprises covering technical, business and working conditions delivered by national training providers.** More than 450 service providers/enterprises in the three countries have been provided with training using developed and adapted training manuals on "*Integrated solid waste management with entrepreneurship Perspective*" to suit the local conditions in the three countries.

**5) Referral services provided to the service providers/enterprises with the micro-finance institutions.** Information on micro financing system and possibilities has been disseminated to the enterprises during training and few have managed to secure credit. However due to lack of collaterals or guarantee fund facility for many SMEs/CBOs it has been very difficult to secure loan/credit for business expansion from financial institutions such as banks .

**6) Formation and strengthening of associations of waste collectors and waste pickers supported-** Six associations in Tanzania have been formed, officially registered and strengthened to improve their management, advocacy and collective bargaining power through a training programme using materials developed and adapted for association building.

**7) Publicity and dissemination campaigns developed with municipalities and small enterprise associations.** Community /stakeholders sensitization strategies/campaigns have been developed and implemented in four out of nine collaborating municipalities. The campaigns are aimed at sensitizing the stakeholders on PPP approach and promoting their participation in paying for the services hence improving the quality of service provision by the SMEs/CBOs, thus proving more jobs opportunities.

**8) Dissemination of lessons learnt through case studies and impact assessment studies contributions to**

| <b>2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished</b> |   |
|---|---|
|   | <p><b>(inter) national workshops on employment creation and micro-enterprise involvement.</b> Baseline study for impact assessment has been conducted in the initial stages of the programme implementation to assess the situation and results disseminated and shared with stakeholders (municipal authorities) at a workshop conducted in 2005. However staff has also attended many KS workshops and shared programme experiences worldwide.</p> <p><b>9) National networks (Urban forum) of stakeholders, national ministries and support organizations providing exchange and mutual support.</b> The programme organized an Urban Forum 19 - 20 June 2006 launched by the Tanzanian Minister responsible for Regional and Local Govt Administration where city and municipal directors, town clerks, mayors, councillors, private sector firms, SMEs/CBOs, recycling industries, citizens and other main actors and policy makers at Local Government level in the three countries of Uganda, Kenya and Tanzania came together to share experiences and contribute on the way forward to have a national strategy to improve solid waste management with the focus of creating more employment to the urban poor. This is a major step to advocating for policy formulation to guide the PPP approach in solid waste management and hence employment creation for sustainability. The theme was: “ <i>Towards Integrated Solid Waste Management Strategy – Tanzania</i>”</p> <p><b>10) Policy and programme development supported on employment creation in municipal service delivery.</b> (see (9) above)- The process just started, more time is needed to achieve this output/outcome through more evidence base with refinements.</p> <p><b>11) Support for improved labour conditions for solid waste workers and reduced incidence of child labour.</b> Issues of OSH and child labour have been incorporated during the trainings and workshop involving social partners (municipal authorities and SMEs/CBOs ) labour issues such as OSH for workers are being monitored now and are part of contracts between municipal authorities and franchisees (SMEs/CBOs) contracted to deliver solid waste collection services. As the result OSH measures are have been improved as more workers are using protective gears and provided with health insurance. More work is still required to be done in the area of social protection improvement.</p> <p><b>12) Developing and submitting proposals for increased resources for programme.</b> A TC-SPROUT for programme extension has been developed waiting to be submitted for DFID, Netherlands funding consideration Local resource mobilization is being done where a proposal for Lake Victoria Initiative has been submitted to SIDA.</p> |
| Latin America                                       | <p><b>In Brazil:</b></p> <p><b>1) Planning activities, institutional strengthening and training.</b></p> <p>- <b>First national planning and training workshop.</b> To familiarize participants to the training manual and information on gender, race, poverty and employment and define the plan of action for the Gender, poverty and employment programme.</p>  |

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

- **Strategic planning workshop.**

- **Thematic meetings.** 9 meetings. This space has been created as a permanent exchange forum for managers of public policies and other partners of the project.

### 2) Activities for/with the major partners to the project

**Labour Ministry.** Focus on social dialogue on domestic work and technical support to the tripartite commission on equality of chances and treatment (gender and race) and support to the coordination office (?) on gender and race.

Training of managers of the *Plan de calificacion social y profesional*; Mainstreaming of gender and race issues. 3 training sessions organized with Plan staff and NGO responsible to give training in some municipalities and other governmental managers. Close to 200 managers received the training.

*Social dialogue on the theme of domestic work and sectoral training plan.* The project is part of the steering committee of this commission.

*Tripartite commission on equalities of chances and treatment in labour market (gender and race).* ILO has a permanent technical advisory status on the commission. The first workshop was organized with the support of the project. The objective was to talk and think about various themes, among which the Brazilian labour market, affirmative action policies, ethics in labour relations, national and international legislation all conceived from a gender and racial point of view.

*Coordination of Gender and Race within the Ministry.* One workshop organized on mainstreaming of gender and race in the ministry's policies.

**Special secretariat for the promotion of racial equality.** Publication of a training material on Gender, race, Poverty and Employment.

**Special secretariat on policies for women.**

**Ministry for Social Development and fight against hunger.** The MDS is part of the project's coordination committee.

**Ministry for social security.** Information and training workshops for regional managers of the education program of the ministry.

**3) Activities for/with project's partners.** Focus on strengthening labour and employers organisations. Strengthening of social dialogue spaces.

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

**4) Pilot projects.** Due to many political changes after the municipal elections that took place during the project, a lot of negotiation has had to occur to insure the continuation of the pilot projects.

- **ABC region.** 2 training activities for municipal managers responsible for the programs to fight poverty, social exclusion and employment generation, labour organizations representatives and women and black people NGOs.

Elaboration of a letter of intent containing the project's objectives to be signed by the 7 regional mayors, labour and employers organizations

Six training workshops for more than 100 public managers responsible for the various social programs (Renda Cidadã, Bolsa Família, Banco de lo Povo, Casa Abrigo, Brasil Alfabetizado and representatives of the women and black communities)

Three other workshops geared toward sensitization and training on racial issues for the municipal statistical offices responsible to modify the data collection tools to include racial and gender dimensions.

Designing of the campaign: Diferenças são naturais, desigualdades não. 40 "outdoors", 10 000 posters, 40 000 leaflets, 5 000 buttons, 7 banners for municipal buildings, 30 seconds radio spots

A working group on gender and racial issues has been created to ensure continuation after the ILO project is completed.

- **Sao Paulo.** Signature of a letter of intent between the municipality, the ILO and the Special Secretariat for the Promotion of Racial Equality and elaboration of a working plan:

Creation of a working group on racial diversity where the project has a permanent technical assistance role. Twelve training workshops geared toward the Secretaria de Desarrollo, Trabajo y Solidaridad's coordinators of programs and other secretariats. (Health, urban planning and urban security). Other workshops for sub secretariats. The working group allowed participants to design their own plans of action taking in racial equality principles. More than 400 persons took part of the training sessions.

The Comisión intersecretarial de monitoreo y gestión de la diversidad took over the Working group after the elections. Renegotiation of the letter of intent. The project has an observatory role. The SP municipality and the ILO are now discussing the way to ensure the sustainability of the project.

**Valle del Jequitinhonha y del Mucuri.** Agreement with the 105 municipalities to implement the Gender, Poverty, Race and Employment.. Training activities. 40 municipal councillors took part in the workshops.

Design of a local development plan that would take in the non discrimination principles.

**Ciudad de Salvador.** In 2003, the ILO participated in a social dialogue process on Racial equality at work.

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

In April 2005, presentation of the GRPE project to the municipality. In November 2005 took place a GRPE implementation seminar in Salvador.

**5) Development of knowledge base, divulgation and multiplication activities.** The project has allowed many studies, publications, divulgation activities and has allowed the publication of articles in various newspapers at important and symbolic dates. To ensure the sustainability of the project, people were trained on how to replicate the training Handbook content.

**Training manual and information on Gender, Racial equality, Poverty and Job creation.** Introduction into an ILO manual on Gender, Poverty and job creation of the racial dimension. Launching of the manual in May 2005.

**Training of trainers workshops.** 40 hours workshop for public managers, labour and employers organizations representatives and NGO. Training of a group of people that will act as disseminating agents.

**6) Closing seminar.** Discussion on the importance of decent work as a central element of social inclusion, gender and racial equality and discussion on actions to be undertaken to promote gender and racial equality as well as decent work.

**7) Articulation with other ILO and UN projects and activities.** The project's staff participated in close to 70 meetings, seminars, panels, book launchings, conferences...

### In Ecuador:

#### 1) Technical support to the Ministry of Labour and Employment

**Interinstitutional Cooperation agreement** between the Labour and Employment Ministry and the Women's national council. It's aim is to promote gender equality in labour related policies in Ecuador and monitor the implementation of international norms related to women's rights.

Creation of the **group on gender and youth equity** in the Ministry of Labour and Employment which pursue the objective of promoting gender equality in labour related policies in Ecuador. Permanent training and sensitization process.

Technical support to the **Ministry of Labour** to incorporate the gender dimension in the Employment Plan.

Technical support to the creation of the **Labour Observatory**.

Technical support to the **National Labour Council**. Information meetings, coordination, working meetings.

| <b>2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished</b> |  |
|---|--|
|   | <p>The objective is to create a Tripartite commission on equality of chances. Declaration on March 8<sup>th</sup> International women's day.</p> <p>Technical support to <b>domestic workers</b>. Coordination, support and follow up to/for domestic workers. Workshop: domestic workers: building an equality agenda.</p> <p><b>2) Promotion and strengthening activities</b></p> <p><b>Reactivation of the Table Gender and Employment policies in Quito.</b> To protect and promote women's right to work and gender equity through gender mainstreaming. Permanent presence of the ILO.</p> <p><b>Creation and strengthening of the Table on Gender, Employment, Tourism and Micro-finances in the province of Azuay.</b> Promotes public policies free of discrimination based on gender, sexual orientation, ethnic, social classes, age or social condition</p> <p><b>Creation and strengthening of the Table on Gender, Employment, Tourism and Micro-finances in the province of Guayas.</b> Promotes social dialogue between ILO constituents, NGO and local governments. Promotes normative changes, pay equity, economic, social and cultural rights based on gender equality. The project contributed to the strategic planning the Table and the development of various training material on gender, poverty, employment and decent work</p> <p><b>3) Sensitization and training activities.</b> 670 persons were trained from local, regional and central government, labour and employers organisations, women organisations, research institutions and NGO. Some 20 different activities were organized. Modular sensitization and training program on gender and decent work, National tripartite seminar on presenting the results of the gender, poverty, employment and race study, Tripartite meeting on gender and strategies to fight poverty, Thematic meeting on informal economy and its links to women's poverty, Conference on the Declaration on fundamental rights and principles at work, Working and sensitization meetings. Training of trainers. Strategic planning. Closing seminar. A delegation of Ecuadorian women participated in a training workshop on negotiation techniques in Montevideo.</p> <p><b>4) Development of a knowledge base.</b> Estudio sobre género, pobreza, trabajo y economía informal en Ecuador. Estudio sobre la situación de migración, género y empleo en Ecuador. Diagnóstico sobre género, condición étnica desigualdad y mercado de trabajo en Ecuador. Propuestas para la transversalización de género en las políticas y programas de empleo en Ecuador.. Actualización y revisión estudio de Maria Arboleda</p> <p><b>5) Articulation with other ILO (Andean countries, OSR Santiago, Turin training center) and UN projects and activities</b></p> |
| Central Asia and                                    | <b>IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 1:</b> National constituents will have been strengthened and capable of designing and   |

| <b>2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished</b> |  |
|---|--|
| Caucasus  | <p>implementing national employment strategies aimed at effective poverty reduction through boosting employment and income opportunities for workers in the informal sector)</p> <p><b>1.1) National employment strategies with special focus on youth employment embedded in national PRSP's formulated and accepted by national authorities</b><br/>           Achieved in Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan</p> <p><b>1.2) Country becomes a Youth Employment Network Champion Country</b><br/>           Achieved by Azerbaijan.<br/>           Advanced version of National Action Plan on Youth Employment (NAPYE) prepared in co-operation with EMP/STRAT</p> <p><b>1.3) Instruments produced for monitoring and evaluating decent work in the informal economy, labour market information for the informal economy improved</b><br/>           Achieved in Kazakhstan ( Decent Work Indicators Survey) and Azerbaijan and Kyrgyzstan (School-to-Work Transition Surveys).</p> <p><b>1.4) Increased capacity of national authorities to analyse current employment and labour market situation for the purposes of policy planning and evaluation</b><br/>           Achieved in Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan in the context of the preparation of the National Employment Programmes</p> <p>The indicators related to immediate objective 1 are:</p> <p><b>Indicator 1) National employment strategies formulated in at least 2 countries (Kyrgyzstan, Azerbaijan)</b><br/>           National employment strategies have been formulated in 3 countries (Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Azerbaijan and endorsed and accepted by national authorities (validated through executive acts of the Government - Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, or through presidential decrees - Azerbaijan)</p> <p><b>Indicator 2: At least one country becomes a YEN Champion country (Azerbaijan)</b><br/>           Azerbaijan has become a YEN Champion country</p> <p><b>Indicator 3: National Statistical Offices able to carry out the indicated surveys in their own capacity</b></p> <p><b>Indicator 4: National Statistical Offices able to process the data and provide comprehensive report</b><br/>           Labour Force Surveys in the form of SWTS were conducted in Kyrgyzstan and Azerbaijan and DWS was done in Kazakhstan. The national statistical offices proved their ability to conduct surveys in their own capacity, as well as to process the data and provide comprehensive reports</p> |

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

### **Indicator 5: National authorities take lead in the development of employment strategies**

There is a strong commitment of the Labour Ministries in Kazakhstan, Azerbaijan and Kyrgyzstan (as well as from the newly set Committee on Migration and Employment in Kyrgyzstan) to undertake a thorough follow-up of the implementation stage and take lead in further development of employment programmes

### **Indicator 6: Routine analytical reports prepared by the national institutions**

In accordance with the requirements of the national regulations

### **Indicator 7: Reports disseminated and used by other institutions among constituents and stakeholders**

The constituents and stakeholders are regularly informed on the findings and results of the analytical reports

**IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 2:** Local government, social partners, and other local actors will have been strengthened and capable of designing and implementing local economic development strategies aimed at effective poverty reduction through boosting employment and income opportunities for workers in the informal sector

### **2.1) Territorial diagnoses and institutional mapping for local economic development**

Carried out in Georgia and completed in Kazakhstan (Karagandy region – under ILO co-funding through cash surplus, and in Taldy-Korgan region with the aim to initiate activities leading to the development of LED strategy).

### **2.2) LED structures created (LED Fora or LED Agencies)**

Assistance provided in the expansion of social dialogue and strengthening of social dialogue mechanism as a consultation forum for LED issues in Kazakhstan (Almaty oblast, TaldyKorgan)

### **2.3) LED strategies formulated in selected regions**

Completed in Taldy-Korgan region of Almaty region, Kazakhstan.

The indicators related to immediate objective 2 are:

### **Indicator 1: Local economic development strategies formulated in selected regions in at least 2 countries (Kazakhstan – Karagandy oblast, Georgia – possibly Borjomi raion)**

Partially achieved only in Kazakhstan – Almaty oblast (Taldy-Korgan). A series of tripartite round tables and workshops held to elaborate approaches for the formulation of LED activities and institutional framework in the selected zone.

### **Indicator 2) LED forum or LED agency in place**

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

Local social partnership mechanism is now in the making to give birth to a LED forum or agency in Taldy-Korgan

### **Indicator 3) LED structures capable of further functioning**

Not achieved

**IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 3:** Constituents and both national and local level will have been strengthened in their ability to form partnerships and participatory approaches to design and implement poverty reduction policies through concrete pilot programmes based on innovative ILO approaches and embedded in the local economic development strategies)

### **3.1) Training for Rural Economic Empowerment adjusted to local conditions and delivered to vulnerable groups (depending on the assessment of current situation including elements of CBT, SIYB, KAB, etc).**

Launched in Georgia (SIYB, KAB), conducted in Kazakhstan (Taldy-Korgan)

**3.2) Market access for informal economy workers** improved “Twinning” relationship with Dutch TC RAM project of SRO Moscow with strong gender component – gender capacity building workshop carried out for project staff and for constituents in Azerbaijan

### **3.3) Micro-credit schemes designed by MoL and MoE improved**

Partially achieved: A survey on microfinance issues was carried out by ILO international expert in May 2005. A round table involving the main microfinance stakeholders in Kazakhstan followed after this survey, which resulted in elaboration of recommendations.

Microfinance activities in Georgia were not implemented due to specific circumstances, as explained elsewhere in this report.

The indicators related to immediate objective 3 are:

### **Indicator 1) Skills and entrepreneurial training delivered to the target groups in at least two countries**

Skills and entrepreneurial training delivered to the target groups in all four Project countries in various forms (SIYB, MES, KAB)

### **Indicator 2) Experimental programmes of Ministries of Labour based on micro-credit improved and implemented with a wider geographical coverage and coverage of vulnerable groups**

Only research and background studies assessing the current situation on micro-credit were made in Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan

### **Indicator 3) Sustainable rate of micro-credit allocation among programme participants between 10 and 20 % (MoL Georgia)**

| <b>2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished</b> |  |
|---|--|
|   | <p>N/A</p> <p><b>Indicator 4) ALMP micro-credit schemes achieve return rates comparable to international standards</b></p> <p>N/A</p> <p><b>Indicator 5) Proportional participation of women ensured in the pilot programmes and among the final beneficiaries of the provided schemes.</b></p> <p>N/A</p>   |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand                       | <p><b>IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 1: To create greater awareness and enhance capacity of ILO constituents and key stakeholders to formulate, implement, monitor and evaluate policies, programmes and projects for the informal economy</b></p> <p><b>Indicator 1) Number of policy documents and action plans for the informal economy:</b> 11 policy studies produced under the project; 4 draft policies produced of which 3 were taken up</p> <p><b>Indicator 2) Amount of budget allocations to improve the informal economy:</b> Budget allocation for action research and action programmes is USD 1 million</p> <p><b>Indicator 3) Number of programmes and projects that address the informal economy:</b> 29 major action programmes designed and implemented under the project</p> <p><b>Indicator 4) Number of reports with information and analysis on the informal economy.</b> 24 reports with information and analysis on the informal economy</p> <p><b>IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 2: To foster enabling environment and enhance capacity of informal economy workers and employers to move towards decent, productive work through realization of their rights, voice and representation</b></p> <p><b>Indicator 1) Number of legal and policy changes adopted:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 11 policy studies produced under the project (Business registration in 2 countries, cooperative law in Mongolia; Labour law in 3 countries, Vending policy in 3 countries, National OSH Profile in Mongolia, Health insurance profile in Mongolia. For each of those studies, the complete evaluation report provide the conclusions and recommendations.</li> <li>- 4 draft policies produced of which 3 were taken up and passed (National OSH Programme in Mongolia and Cambodia, Mongolian Policy on Informal Employment; Informal Gold Mining in draft form and not yet passed)</li> <li>- 5 sets of organizational policies/procedures (SBA manual, PADEK and self-help groups, Trade union, AAC's organizational development consultancy, clustering under Homenet,)</li> </ul> |

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

- At least 12 sets of technical procedures developed or improved (Public health care unit in Thailand, Agricultural extension in Cambodia and Thailand, Farming work methods under SVPP, AAC product & market development, Homenet handicraft, IRAP, GRET, WISH, WIND, HIV-AIDS Toolkit, Get Ahead in the 3 countries, DPLW in Thailand)

### **Indicator 2) Number of informal economy workers and employers organized**

- Over 7,500 people reached through the organizing and capacity building programmes introduced.
- Mongolia reached 2047 people through capacity building programmes, of which 65 percent were women
- Cambodia reached nearly 4,000 workers/employers in the informal economy (i.e. CAID 600+ informal workers, IDEA 300+ beer girls/vendors/waiters/waitresses, CFBW 1,500+ construction workers, CUF 150+porters/brick workers, CCTUF 100+ workers, CIFUF 100+ agriculture workers/farmers, SVPP 120 farmers, CTAP 50 musicians, AAC 300+ handicraft producers and community shop with around 700 shareholders).
- Thailand reached 1482 workers/entrepreneurs (744 homebased workers reached and organized through the study circle activities; 500 members of Thaicraft; 50 through the employers' organization; 188 through trade union related activities)

### **Indicator 3) Number of organizations of informal economy workers and employers participating in relevant public processes**

- 42 trade unions and member-based associations in the three countries participating in organizing and awareness raising on legal rights and decent work solutions. (14 trade unions in Mongolia; 12 workers' and member-based organizations in Cambodia; 16 trade unions in Thailand)
- 35 local organisations/companies participated in the August 2005 product fair in Siem Reap (name list is as in the Product Fair report).
- 75 organisations and companies participated in February 2006 product fair in Phnom Penh (name list is as in the Product Fair report).

### **Indicator 4) Number of strategic and supportive links established between employers' and workers' organizations and informal economy workers and employers**

- 101 courses on work improvement in the three countries = 67 (CMB); 18 (MON); 16 (THA) courses in work improvement/OSH have been offered with strategic and supportive links between workers' and government's organisations and IE workers and employers.
- 24 (10 in CMB, 14 in MON, training workshops on IE workers organising were provided with support of IE workers' and employers' organisations.
- 2 product fairs "Buy Cambodian Products" were successfully organised through a strong strategic and

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

supportive links established between employers' and workers' organisations and the government's departments.

### **Indicator 5) Percentage and number of women, youth and people with disabilities who are members and decision makers in informal economy organizations**

In Cambodia

- Selection of AAC as partner organizations; 25% of AAC membership are people with disability; 50% women managers/decision makers in its member organisations and 10% youth among producers.

- Support to 12 community Shops:

Management committee of the community shop involves at least 40% of women in decision making process.

Around 700 members/shareholders made up of at least 76% of women

### **IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 3: To increase earnings of beneficiaries in replicable pilot projects for higher productivity and market access through activities that enhance representation and voice outlined in Objective 2**

#### **Indicator 1) Number of informal economy workers and employers participating in the pilot projects**

2,988 workers or entrepreneurs participating in activities relating to productivity and market access (1736 in Cambodia, 857 in Thailand, 321 in Mongolia)

#### **Indicator 2) Percentage and number of women, youth and people with disabilities participating in project activities**

Breakdown in Cambodia for example:

- 146 farming households participated in SVPP of which 54 per cent is woman as direct beneficiary.

- CTAP has included 64 workers of which. 38%, 20% and 33% accounted for women, youth and disabled respectively participated in the traditional musician/dancer training.

- AAC member organisations have increased from 12 (2004) to 27 (April 2006), currently employing over 650 among which 33 per cent is disabled and landmine survivors and 75 per cent is poor woman.

- Support to 12 community Shops:

24 or (40%) Management committee members have benefited from the programme.

700 members/shareholders of the 12 shops, 76% women

- 11 (36% women) representatives of the IE project's partner organisation participated in training on GET Ahead and SIYB provided by ILO/ ISED

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

- 90 farmers (65 %) participated in EM fertilizer application training
- 60 IE workers and employers attended the training on organising by IDEA
- 15 farmers attended SBA training provided by Agrikhmer.

### **Indicator 3) Average earnings of informal economy workers in pilot projects**

- In Thailand, average earnings of handicraft producers under pilot projects ranged from \$35-125 per month; with mostly earning about \$75
- In Cambodia, average earnings ranged from \$30-50 per month for farmers, \$24 for musicians, \$40-120 for handicraft workers.

Examples of changes in incomes after the intervention are illustrated below:

- For 15-month technical support on handicraft product development and marketing for AAC and its member organisations has increased in number of producers/workers from 365 (12 member organisations) to 668 (22 member organisations) with income rates ranging from \$40 to \$120/month per worker (average monthly earnings \$70). (See the internal evaluation report of AAC). Also, gross sale has been increased from USD560,000.00 in 2004 to USD1,000,000.00 (78.5% hike) in 2005 for AAC's 22 member organisations.
- Community-based Traditional Art Performance (CTAP) has provided regular income for musician and dancer groups. Income improvements for a period of nine months (January-September) were recorded for the groups, ranging from USD 374.00 to USD 715.00. (See attached income statement Jan-Jun and the 3<sup>rd</sup> quarterly report provided by APDO). As of December 2005, it was reported that 56% of the trained musicians earned above US\$24 per month while before they had not.
- Farmers participating in the Smallholder Vegetable Production Project (SVPP) have earned each \$30 (average) up to \$50 per month over the last 12 months (while previously had earned twice less than that of from other agricultural activities such as collecting firewood and forest products faraway from home)

### **IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 4: To identify and implement concrete measures to improve the social protection of informal economy workers and employers through representative organisations**

#### **Indicator 1) Number of research documents and strategy papers produced**

12 produced all in all as follows:

Mongolia (6): National OSH Programme; Health Insurance Profile; National OSH Profile; Draft legislation for artisan miners; Policy on Informal Employment and Action Programme

Cambodia (3): National OSH Programme; Economic assessment of 400 households for possible extension of SHI scheme; Tools for monitoring and reporting of insurance and MIS produced by GRET

Thailand (3): Impact of work improvement on home-workers; strategy formulated by MOPH on OSH

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

services in PCUs; strategy formulated by MOAC on OSH input by extension workers

### **Indicator 2) Number of items prepared for publicity and media**

2 press releases on OSH training were circulated with support from ROAP Media Officer; 3 press releases in Thailand for OSH, social security and labour protection seminars; 1 press release in Mongolia on work improvement activities

- 2 TV interviews on work improvement training in Mongolia
- In Cambodia, 7 interviews were given out by the NPC to media concerning the project activities.
- Conference newspaper and articles made available on wire service of InterPress
- 4 news clips produced on WISH, IRAP, SIYB in local newspapers

### **Indicator 3) Number of training materials produced**

Handbooks and documentation of OSH services for Primary Health Care in Thailand

- WISH/WIND finalized and to be published in English, Mongolian and Cambodian
- WISCON training package and documentation produced and published in Khmer and Mongolian.
- SHI Awareness workshop materials were produced.
- HIV/AIDS Toolkit produced and printed in English and Khmer

### **Indicator 4) Number of people in pilot projects covered by social security including micro-insurance**

- In Cambodia: Community-based health insurance expansion has been expanded in Ang Roka District (Takeo Province) where currently there are around 5000 covered under the scheme with the project support on promotion, awareness raising, developing monitoring and impact assessment tools..

### **Indicator 5) Number of participants in training programmes for micro-insurance, WISH, WIND, WISCON and HIV/AIDS**

- 2,548 workers and entrepreneurs trained in work improvement programmes
- In Mongolia, 353 trained in work improvement programmes
- In Cambodia, 1815 (47% women) IE workers and employers participating in the training programme on work improvement (WISH, WIND & WISCON) by trained local trainers.
- In Thailand, 380 farmers trained in WIND
- 85 participants (39% women) from IE organisations participated in HIV/AIDS Awareness and Prevention training using the newly developed toolkit. - 26 participants (46% women) trained as trainers of the HIV/AIDS Toolkit from Government, employers' and workers' organisations and IE organisations
- 101 CMB representatives from Government, Employers' and Workers' organisations and IE associations

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

attended the TOT on WISH, WIND and WISCON since August 2004 (double counting possible)

- 31 participants (39% women) from Government, employers' and workers' organisations and IE organisations attended the SHI Awareness Workshop.

### **Indicator 6) No of solutions and advocacy interventions by informal economy workers and employers to address vulnerabilities**

OSH deliver services developed in Primary Health Care Units, Agricultural Extension, and Vocational Training, trade union organizing

- Tools for monitoring and reporting of insurance MIS produced by GRET. Expansion of social health insurance in urban areas
- First SHI Awareness workshop held in Phnom Penh in October 24-28, 2005 in collaboration with the Ministry of Health and GRET.
- Informal working group of ILO-WHO-GTZ hold a regular meeting on SHI development in Cambodia
- Recommendations made on the extension of social security to the informal economy in Thailand
- Study circle guides developed to increase awareness of home workers on decent work issues and solutions

### **IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE 5: To facilitate replication of lessons learnt and good practices from pilot projects, as part of the ILO's global programme on the informal economy**

#### **Indicator 1) Number of impact assessment methods and tools developed, tested and used**

- Baseline survey is conducted by partners at the beginning of the project. Baseline information has been collected and used as basis for comparison of difference (before and after the project's intervention).
- Documentation of the process being done by partners (Hurredo, AAC and HR Inc.)
- All partners are required to identify their indicators in the action plan proposal
- Internal evaluation exercises at the end of pilot project are required to incorporate in their proposal with a minimum budget.

#### **Indicator 2) Number of participatory assessments by informal economy workers and employers**

- Product fairs in Siem Reap and Phnom Penh for local producers to exchange ideas and experiences on doing a successful business and improved product quality and consistency.
- AAC, Agrihmer and APDO has conducted an internal participatory evaluation exercise. A report was produced.
- OSH checklists and body mapping methods developed by Thailand's primary health care units

## 2. Which were the main outcomes accomplished

### **Indicator 3) Number of good practices identified and documented**

- 5 proposals submitted by IE Project to Geneva to highlight best practices being implemented by partners in June 2005.
- Photo-book of work improvement methods to be published
- Manuals and documentation on good practices developed: handicraft promotion, OSH in vocational training, IRAP in Mongolia, work improvement manuals, study circle guide, clustering and market development, self-help group development by PADEK, primary health care services on OSH
- A project video documentary is being produced with documented good practices drawn from strategies towards promoting DW for the IE in Cambodia.

### **Indicator 4) Improved labour market information on informal economy available**

- Literature review done in three countries provide data and statistics on the informal economy
- An IE Policy Review in Cambodia provides labour market information on IE with gender perspective. A report is being finalised and will make available in 2006

### **Indicator 5) Number of successful sub-regional meetings on lessons learnt**

- A regional SBA workshop where the countries came together with Lao and Vietnam to share experiences at Phnom Penh in January 2005.
- Cambodian handicraft producers attended the International Fair to learn new approaches and share experiences in Bangkok International Gift Fair in April 2005.
- An ILO knowledge sharing in the IE was held in Siem Reap in November 28-30, 2005.
- An experience and knowledge sharing meeting for SE Asia held in Siem Reap in December 1-3, 2005.
- IE Project contributing and supporting partners' participation in the Regional workshop on Freedom of Association and Organizing in the Informal Economy, organized by ILO ACTRAV and ITC on 21-25 November 2005.
- Theme Seminar on Labour Protection Strategies and Vending Policies held on 8-11 May 2006, where project partners responsible for the relevant subject matters participated

### **Indicator 6) Number of impact assessment results used for improved strategies in the IE**

- Impact assessment methodology developed by Project Evaluator in November 2005. Working draft.
- The results of project evaluation by the consultant could also be used for better intervention strategies in the IE.

| 3. Which were the main problems you have encountered during execution? |   |
|--|---|
| Eastern Africa   | <p>1) <b>Slow response from the social partners</b> (Local Government authorities) who are the main implementers. This caused delay in formation of Technical committees in the municipalities which were aimed to oversee and facilitate implementation monitoring of the implementation of programme activities in on the ground. Also this caused the delay on the Formation of Programme Advisory Committee (PAC) and important organ to advise on the programme implementation process.</p> <p>2) <b>Budgetary constraints</b> to meet the arising demand of the programme activities in the municipalities.</p> <p>3) <b>Time constraints</b>. The programme delayed four months to start on the ground and further delays caused by slow response of the social partners. This has affected the emergence of tangible achievement at outcome level. The programme needed more time to design and implement an exit strategy through policy development and reform mainstreamed into the respective Governments for sustainability.</p>   |
| Latin America  | <p><b>In Brazil:</b></p> <p>1) Political instability or changing political situation.</p> <p>2) Necessity to find ways to ensure dissemination of project material, which commends more time and resources. Some work done in the course of the project will not be printed/disseminated.</p> <p><b>In Ecuador:</b></p> <p>1) Political and social instability.</p> <p>2) The level of inequality (race and gender) and the weakness of the existing policies to fight those.</p> <p>3) Numerically limited team dedicated to the project.</p>  |
| Central Asia and Caucasus  | <p>1) The main difficulty that has confronted the project during the Project lifetime period has been <b>the delay and uncertainty regarding the implementation of project activities in Georgia</b>. Due to the unstable political situation and restructuring of Government Agencies, it was difficult to find a proper technical counterpart for the concrete implementation of project activities.</p> <p>2) Furthermore, the Head of Employment Department of the Ministry of Health, Social Protection and Labour, who had been <b>the main technical counterpart</b> during the preparatory stage of this project and the initial stages up until the training in Turin, <b>has left the Ministry soon afterwards</b> (in June 2004)</p> <p>3) <b>The post of National project Co-ordinator in Georgia was vacated</b> after three months as per request of constituents, who claimed that they would provide better candidates for the position</p> <p>4) Another problem stems from the fact that ILO <b>does not have accredited offices and staff in the project countries</b>, which makes practical implementation difficult, and some delays may be encountered due to the need to first build up a field structure under the TC project</p> <p>5) When local hiring is done, <b>the local offices are not in a position to provide a longer-term perspective</b>, which results in staff fluctuations and possibly losing the more qualified people to other projects or international</p> |

| 3. Which were the main problems you have encountered during execution? |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>agencies</p> <p>6) Another difficulty is <b>the lack of clearness regarding the continued funding</b>, once the investment is being made into establishment of local structures, equipment, and mostly the build-up of credibility and awareness raising for the used approaches among the constituents.</p> <p>7) Also, <b>continued insecurity regarding the possibility of loosing the approved funding</b> could have some demoralising effects on the staff.</p> <p>8) <b>The project seemed to be understaffed</b> in terms of supervising the operations.</p> |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand  | <p><b>Mongolia:</b></p> <p>1) (Might not be a problem per se) The recent transition from a centralized and planned economy to a open market economy.</p> <p>2) Weak institutions (business associations)</p> <p><b>Cambodia:</b></p> <p>1) The fragility of the institutions.</p> <p>2) The legacy of a war-torn country.</p>   |

| 4. Which were the effects of the outcomes mentioned (if any) |   |
|--|---|
| (a) Government (local, regional, national)                   |   |
| Eastern Africa   | <p>1) <b>Local Authorities (municipalities) have functioning M&amp;E system for service provision</b> –Tools have been developed and used to gather required information and data enabling them to assess the performance of the service delivery.</p> <p>2) <b>Understanding of the PPP approach has improved</b>, more municipalities are now engaging private sector, more specifically the Informal groups in service delivery thus improving the quality of the services as well as service coverage to the poor urban areas.</p> <p>3) <b>Improvement in environmental cleanliness.</b> Waste collection rates and capacity have increased in the urban centres as the result of private sector participation.</p> <p>4) <b>Cost saving by Local Government authorities.</b> Engagement of private sector in solid waste management service delivery has reduced expenditures in this area as Municipal authorities are left with supervision only and are not providing services directly.</p> |
| Latin America  | See below. Question 2.  |

| 4. Which were the effects of the outcomes mentioned (if any) |  |
|--|--|
| (a) Government (local, regional, national)                   |  |
| Central Asia and Caucasus                                    | <p>1) The national authorities in Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Azerbaijan are capable of <b>formulating national employment strategies</b>;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- National authorities in Azerbaijan are capable of formulating national employment policies and action plans towards youth;</li> <li>- The State Statistical Agency of Kazakhstan is able to carry out a Decent Work Indicator Survey</li> <li>- The Ministry of Labour of Azerbaijan is able to carry out School-to-Work Transition Survey in Azerbaijan (SWTS results has been published in May 2006).</li> </ul> <p>2) The social <b>dialogue is used</b> as a standard mechanism in employment related issues in Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan and Azerbaijan (“general agreement on social partnership”, signed by Government, Federation of Trade Union, Confederation of Employers in Kyrgyzstan and social partnership principles are included in the national employment strategies for 2006-2015 in Azerbaijan).</p> <p>3) The <b>regional authorities</b> (specifically in Taldy-Korgan, Kazakhstan) possess now a <b>better knowledge and skills on how to introduce local economic development in their region</b> and more and better knowledge on the <b>methodology of conducting labour market research</b> with the aim of creating a system of interaction between employers, vocational schools and local government</p> <p>4) Impact on the <b>Vocational Technical Training System</b> in Kyrgyzstan is visible in <b>the improvement of the general level of the curriculum</b> through introduction of basic entrepreneurship training in the curriculum in Kyrgyzstan through introduction of KAB as an obligatory course in 40 vocational schools and availability of full set of training materials (KAB-modules).</p> <p>5) Impact on <b>Modular Training Centres for unemployed</b> in Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan is visible due to availability of MES training materials (modular packages) for 15 professions in local languages and training equipment for MES centres in all four Project countries.</p> |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand                                | (See above)  |

| (b) Workers (formal and informal) |   |
|-----------------------------------|---|
| Eastern Africa                    | 1) More poor people have secured employment in the service and waste recycling industry therefore improving their income. As December 2005 more than 4000 jobs have been created in the service industry of solid waste |

|                               |  |
|-------------------------------|--|
|                               | <p>collection in Tanzania, Kenya and Uganda. Gender equality is taken care of as more women are engaged. A study in 2005 showed that 50% of the workers in this sector are women.</p> <p>2) Informal workers in the service industry have been recognized by the Local authorities and stakeholders as they are more organized through association formation.</p> <p>3) Improvement in working conditions, OSH measure are being addressed by the workers ie protective gears are being provided and used therefore reducing the risks of accidents and from hazardous waste.</p>  |
| Latin America                 | <p><b>In Brazil</b></p> <p>1) First workshop on planning worker's participation in the project.</p> <p>2) A second workshop to discuss implementation strategies. . In the training sessions, an important focus was placed on collective bargaining to promote and strengthen equality</p> <p>3) Important labour organizations' participation in the campaign ton ratify the ILO Convention 156.</p> <p>4) One seminar on the normative role of the ILO was organized.</p> <p>5) The project also contributed to the publication of Semear de Vitorias, underlining the 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the <i>Instituto Intersindical Interamericano para la Igualdad Racial</i>.</p> <p><b>In Ecuador:</b></p> <p>1) Technical support to Labour organizations. Working meetings. The objective is to organize sensitization and training activities for the various labour organizations and help in organizing the Gender Andean sub-regional agenda.</p> |
| Central Asia and Caucasus     | Impact on the trade unions is associated with their relevant input into the National Employment Programmes (NEP) in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Azerbaijan.   |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand | (See above)  |

### (c) Employers

|                |  |
|----------------|--|
| Eastern Africa | <p>1) A number of Private sector organizations engaged in the service position industry are adhering to OSH measures and providing protective gears and heath facilities to the workers, thus improving the working conditions.</p> <p>2) Have managed to secure some credit enabling them to secure working tools thus improving their capacity</p> |
|----------------|--|

| <b>(c) Employers</b>          |  |
|-------------------------------|--|
|                               | hence providing more jobs opportunities to the poor.   |
| Latin America                 | <p><b>In Brasil :</b></p> <p>1) Presence in the <i>Tripartite commission on equalities of chances and treatment in labour market (gender and race)</i>.</p> <p>2) The project has collaborated to the launching of the research: <i>Perfil social, Racial y de género de las 500 mayores empresas de Brasil y sus actions afirmativas en 2004 y 2006</i>.</p> <p>3) The project has collaborated to the elaboration of: Ethos. <i>El compromiso de las empresas con la valorización de la mujer</i> (Eept 2004) and of <i>El compromiso de las empresas con la promoción de la igualad racial</i> (May 2006).</p> <p>4) Participation in the inauguration of the <i>Instituto brasileno da diversidad, institucion de asesoria y produccion de conocimientos sobre la diversidad para la empreses</i>.</p> <p><b>In Ecuador:</b></p> <p>1) Meetings with employer's organizations to introduce them to GRPE through national seminars and trainings of trainers.</p> |
| Central Asia and Caucasus     | <p>1) Impact on employers' organizations is associated with <b>their relevant input into the National Employment Programmes (NEP) in Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan and Azerbaijan</b></p> <p>2) <b>Involvement of Confederation of Employers</b> in vocational training through "coordination counsel for social partnership in the area of vocational training" in Kyrgyzstan and "coordinating councils" in Azerbaijan</p>  |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand | (See above)  |

| <b>(d) Civil society</b> |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Eastern Africa           | 1) NGOs and CBOs in particular in the Informal Economy interests, are now part of the pro poor PPP approaches in contributing to poverty reduction while contributing to environmental cleanliness.  |
| Latin America            | <p><b>In Brasil :</b></p> <p>ABC region (Sao Paulo). 2 training activities for municipal managers responsible for the programs to fight poverty, social exclusion and employment generation, labour organizations representatives and women and black people NGOs.</p> |

| <b>(d) Civil society</b>      |  |
|-------------------------------|--|
| Central Asia and Caucasus     | (No information provided)  |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand | (See above). The project seems to have worked with many various NGO. The complete list is integrated into the final evaluation report. |

| <b>5. If you could keep on supporting the activities integrated in the project, on what would you focus on?</b> |   |
|---|---|
| Eastern Africa  | <p>1) Policy reform- sensitization and advocacy for policy reform to support the PPP, such as advocating and facilitating review of municipal bylaws, contracts and formulation of SWM policy in the three countries.(Develop an exit strategy that aims at policy adoption and mainstreamed into Government budgets.)</p> <p>2) Strengthening the SMEs/CBO and Informal Economy operators by improving their accessibility to credit facilities for expansion hence improving their capacity to provide quality service and therefore increased income.</p> <p>3) Improving the Social Protection and Labour conditions issues in the service provision industry of the informal Economy.</p> <p>4) Community sensitization at all levels for improved participation in the service provision using the PPP approach</p> |
| Latin America   | (No information provided)   |
| Central Asia and Caucasus   | (No information provided)   |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand   | (No information provided)   |

| <b>6. After completion of the project, will you be able to keep on carrying out activities connected to the achieved outcomes?</b> |  |
|--|--|
| Eastern Africa   | It is expected that the Municipal authorities whose capacity has been improved through various trainings provided by the programme will continue to support the Enterprises/service providers to continue with the PPP in service delivery thus creating more job opportunities and improving the services to reach the poor urban. The Local Training institutions will continue to provide the required support in the form of training on demand basis using the developed manuals, which are left in their custody. More time is still required for consolidation and mentorship as the approach is still new. |

| 6. After completion of the project, will you be able to keep on carrying out activities connected to the achieved outcomes? |                           |
|---|---------------------------|
| Latin America   | (No information provided) |
| Central Asia and Caucasus   | (No information provided) |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand   | (No information provided) |

| 7. Have you identified possible funding sources at the local, regional or central level to keep on carrying out the project's activities? |   |
|---|---|
| Eastern Africa  | Not yet but have developed a proposal for SIDA Nairobi. |
| Latin America   | (No information provided)                               |
| Central Asia and Caucasus   | (No information provided)                               |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand   |   |

| 8. Please, list any publications, training material, presentation or any other way of disseminating the project's outcomes |  |
|--|--|
| Eastern Africa   | <p>1) Training materials on “ Integrated Solid Waste Management with Entrepreneurial Perspective” ( Technical and Business training manuals , Trainers Guide and Business Plan - in Kiswahili and English for Tanzania, in English for Kenya and Uganda)</p> <p>2) Informal Economy Training manual for Tanzania ( in English and Kiswahili)</p> <p>3) M&amp;E workshop Reports ( 2005 &amp; 2006)</p> <p>4) Documentary on Programme activities and Impact in Tanzania 2005&amp; 2006</p> <p>5) Evaluation Reports.</p> |
| Latin America  | <p><b>In Brazil:</b></p> <p>1) Manual de Capacitação e Informação sobre Gênero, Raça, Pobreza e Emprego. OIT. Brasília: OIT/SEPP/PIR/PNUD, 2005. (8 módulos)</p>   |

| 8. Please, list any publications, training material, presentation or any other way of disseminating the project's outcomes |   |
|--|---|
|  | <p>2) Questionando um Mito: custos do trabalho de homens e mulheres na América Latina. Laís Abramo (ed.). Brasília: OIT, 2005. 196 p.</p> <p>3) Semear de Vitórias. OIT/INSPIR. São Paulo: OIT/INSPIR, 2005. 124 p.</p> <p>4) Trabalho a domicílio na cadeia do vestuário no Brasil. Laís Abramo, Giovanna Rossignotti, Solange Sanches (ed.) Brasília: OIT/DIEESE/Observatório Social, 2006. 167 p. (no prelo)</p> <p>5) Gênero, Raça, Pobreza e Emprego: o Programa GRPE no Brasil. Brasília: OIT, 2006.</p> <p>6) Caderno GRPE n.1 – Negociação coletiva e igualdade de gênero na América Latina. Laís Abramo y Marta Rangel. Brasília: OIT, 2005. 64 p.</p> <p>7) Caderno GRPE n. 2 – Desigualdades raciais e de gênero no Serviço Público Civil. Rafael Guerreiro Osório. Brasília: OIT, 2006.</p> <p>8) Caderno GRPE n. 3 – O emprego doméstico: uma ocupação tipicamente feminina. Departamento Intersindical de Estatísticas e Estudos Socioeconômicos – DIEESE. Brasília: OIT, 2006.</p> <p>9) Press Release: 8 de Março - Dia Internacional da Mulher . OIT. Brasília: OIT, março de 2005 (<a href="http://www.oitbrasil.org.br">www.oitbrasil.org.br</a>).</p> <p>10) Press Release: 20 de Novembro: Trabalho Doméstico e Igualdade de Gênero e Raça: desafios para promover o Trabalho Decente no Brasil. OIT. Brasília: OIT, novembro de 2005 (<a href="http://www.oitbrasil.org.br">www.oitbrasil.org.br</a>).</p> <p>11) Press Release: 8 de Março: efeitos da desigualdade de gênero e raça nos rendimentos e despesas das famílias brasileiras. OIT. Brasília: OIT, março de 2006. (<a href="http://www.oitbrasil.org.br">www.oitbrasil.org.br</a>).</p> <p><b>In Ecuador:</b></p> <p>1) Publication of 2 000 Modules on ILO Conventions related to Equality and national norms for women.</p> |
| Central Asia and Caucasus  | (No information provided)   |
| Cambodia, Mongolian, Thailand  | <p>1) Informal Gold Mining in Mongolia: A Baseline Survey Report Covering Burnuur and Zamaar Soums, Tuv Aimag by <i>T. Navch, Ts. Bolormaa, B. Enkhtsetseg, D. Khurelmaa, B. Munkhjargal</i></p> <p>2) Handbook on Decent work in the Informal Economy in Cambodia by <i>the Economic Institute of Cambodia</i></p> <p>3) Fighting Poverty from the Street: A Survey of Street Food Vendors in Bangkok by <i>Narumol Nirathron, PhD</i></p> <p>4) National Occupational Safety and Health Profile of Mongolia by <i>Nyam Ayush, Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour</i></p>   |

**8. Please, list any publications, training material, presentation or any other way of disseminating the project's outcomes**

- 5) Decent Work in the Informal Economy in Cambodia *by the Economic Institute of Cambodia*
  - 6) Extending Labour Law to All Workers: Promoting Decent Work in the Informal Economy in Cambodia, Thailand and Mongolia *Edited by David Tajgman*
  - 7) ILO. Work Improvement for Neighbourhood Development *Mongolian version Cambodian version forthcoming by Tsuyoshi Kawakami, Ton That Khai, Kazutaka Kogi*
  - 8) ILO/ASIST-AP. Guideline for Integrated Rural Accessibility Planning (IRAP) in Mongolia *by Chloe Pearce*
  - 9) Published by Labour and Social Welfare and Service Office, Ministry of Social Welfare and Labour (MOSWL). Integrating Occupational Safety and Health in Vocational Training
  - 10) ILO. Work Improvement for Safe Homes (forthcoming) English edition Cambodian edition Mongolian edition by Tsuyoshi Kawakami, Sara Arphorn, Yuka Ujita
  - 11) ILO/IE project. Handicraft Sector Design and Business Development Manual *by Bronwyn Blue*
  - 12) Sustainable Alternative Development Association. Campaigning for Workers' Rights: A Handbook for Home-based Worker Network
  - 13) Sustainable Alternative Development Association. Capability Building on Product Development and Promotion of Networks of Home-based Workers
- Forthcoming publications:**
- 1) Easing the barriers to formality: Registration Procedures in Mongolia *by Tsetsen Dashtseren and Joel Cachet*
  - 2) Street Vending in Mongolia *by the Mongolian Cooperative Training and Information Center*
  - 3) Easing the Barriers to Formality : Registration Procedures for Micro-enterprises and Handicraft Exports in Cambodia *by the Artisan Association of Cambodia*
  - 4) On the Borders of Legality: A Review of Studies in Street Vending in Phnom Penh, Cambodia *by Kyoko Kusakabe, PhD*
  - 5) Policy of Inclusion and Exclusion: Local Planning and Registration on Vending in Bangkok *by Vichai Rupkamdee and others* Policy issues in street vending: An overview of studies in Thailand, Cambodia and Mongolia *by Kyoko Kusakabe, PhD*

| 9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports |  |
|---|--|
| Eastern Africa  | (No other information)   |
| America Latina  | <p><b>Lessons learned:</b></p> <p><b>In Brazil:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Importance to deal with <b>race and gender at the same time.</b></li> <li>2) Importance to focus on national policies and policies that impact informal workers</li> <li>3) As far as training of trainers, there seem to be a need to have a longer time frame for the training activities. This will allow trainers to offer support for the implementation of planes.</li> <li>4) There is a need to learn how to cope with political instability.</li> <li>5) The importance to act at the local, regional and national level in designing and promoting public policies.</li> <li>6) The importance to reach out to the medias to ensure a broader dissemination of the message.</li> <li>7) The importance of partners' financial contribution to strengthen the initial budget and to ensure their real ownership.</li> <li>8) The importance of the knowledge of the ILO for project's staff</li> <li>9) The importance of focussing on synergies between other ILO projects and projects and offices of other UN agencies.</li> <li>10) The necessity to increase the information available on race and gender and to disseminate it.</li> <li>11) The necessity to continue mainstreaming of gender and racial issues in public policies.</li> <li>12) The importance of social dialogue to reach the equality objectives.</li> <li>13) The importance to make visible the links between economic and social policies as far as equality goes.</li> <li>14) Put forth actions and policies that are "irreversible" in order to reach the equality point.</li> </ol> <p><b>In Ecuador:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) As far as training of trainers, there seem to be a need to have a longer time frame for the training activities. This will allow to offer support for the implementation of planes</li> <li>2) The importance of aiming for institutional changes to guarantee long term equality</li> </ol> |

| 9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports |  |
|---|--|
|   | 3) The importance to work in cooperation from local to national and vice versa   |
| Central Asia and Caucasus                                     | <p><b>Lessons learned:</b></p> <p>1) PRSP documents are relatively weak on employment issues. There is a <b>need for more comprehensive national employment policies within the PRSP frameworks in Azerbaijan and Kyrgyzstan. Though not a PRSP country, same need in Kazakhstan.</b> There is a need for ILO's conceptual approach to the employment frameworks, and <b>ILO GEA is being used by SRO Moscow as a tool and guideline for development of these employment frameworks with ILO's technical assistance in the countries of the sub-region.</b></p> <p>2) The topics of <b>informal economy and youth employment are highly relevant</b> in the project countries and "wanted" by both national and international counterparts. International agencies and large donors are aware of the importance of the informal sector, but most of them do not have programmes/initiatives that would try to address this issue in a more direct way. Therefore, <b>ILO's activities in the field of informal economy has been widely welcomed and supported by both national and international community.</b></p> <p>3) Topical approaches that seem to be most directly linked to the informal sector are the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>Support to employment creation in the SME sector.</b> Here ILO has a number of well-developed and more-less readily available tools, such as, for example, training packages SIYB and KAB, GMT, eventually the future LODE, etc.;</li> <li>- <b>ILO's survey tools</b> such as the Decent Work Indicators' Survey, or School-to-Work Transition Survey, that contribute to mapping of the situation in the informal sector that is very poorly documented;</li> <li>- <b>Training and LED approaches related to community-based methodologies (CBT, TREE), or skills development training based on MES (modular employable skills).</b> Community-based approaches ensure mobilisation of a wider stratum of the society, including the informal tiers. Modular Employable Skills are suitable for their flexibility – a short course can be used for youth in informal conditions, who cannot afford to attend a regular longer-term TVT education.</li> </ul> <p>4) <b>The limited administrative capacity of the ILO core staff</b>, given that short-term project staff cannot deal effectively with financial procedures and procurement, that field structures are absent in some countries, or rather overloaded in other countries, so project workplan targets are hit thanks to the dedicated work of the staff.</p> <p>5) The project <b>activities have benefited from timely and highly qualified interventions of technical specialists form both the field and ILO Headquarters</b> (technical departments with the Employment Sector), which gave us an advantage over other international organisations (EU TACIS, GTZ, etc.) that have been implementing projects in the field relying more-less exclusively externally hired short-term technical consultants. In</p> |

| <b>9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports</b> |  |
|--|--|
|  | <p>this comparison, the ILO's asset has been quick, consistent, and high-quality technical performance.</p> <p><b>6) Political instability and uncertainty in Georgia should be taken into account.</b> The planned activities should be revised in the light of the timeframe of the project. Notably, the LED component should focus more on the BDS part – in particular the provision of entrepreneurial training that has been already successfully launched, and the micro-finance component should be reduced, as the personnel at the MoL that suggested these activities, as well as the related ALMP programmes have changed.</p>  |
| Cambodia,<br>Mongolian,<br>Thailand                                  | <p><b>Mongolia:</b></p> <p>It is deemed that further deepening of capacities are required to support the momentum generated, integrate programme and policy gains achieved within participating institutions, and continue the path towards policy and institutional development.</p> <p><b>Lessons learned from experiences in linking markets</b></p> <p>1) It is learned that there are complexities of implementing community projects at the grassroots level, in which the solutions to problems are often multi-faceted. The programme has tackled quite a number of emerging issues during the course of its implementation beyond its mandate and assumptions, including the guaranteed supply of quality seeds, appropriate water irrigating solutions for participating farmers, special support approach adapted to the needs of disabled and non-literate target beneficiaries. It is required to exercise greater caution in the project development and innovative implementing strategies.</p> <p>2) Skills transfer requires the follow-up support with a prolonged period of mentoring and coaching to give these farmers and musicians the opportunity, ability and confidence to tackle higher level issues of supply chains and other higher complex problems such as production plan and efficiency, market predictability, product quality and consistency, marketing cooperative and network, and group building.</p> <p>3) Partnership with key stakeholders to implement the programme is central to ensuring success of interventions through participatory implementation approach. This gives all involved the ownership, active participation and avenue for synergies. The programme has enjoyed strong cooperation and support from local governments (DAFF, Department of Fine Art), community leaders (self-help groups, commune and district leaders) and employer association (Siem Reap Angkor Hotel and Guesthouse Association). This partnership better guarantees that the initiative is strengthened or upscaled and that the support created remains available after the project finishes.</p> <p><b>Lessons learned from OSH interventions</b></p> <p>1. Easy-to-apply OSH tools such as the action-checklists developed by the ILO and photo sheets developed during the project have greatly assisted trained local trainers and participants in bringing low-cost, practical OSH improvement ideas into action. Through follow-up visits, it was observed that home workers, farmers and construction workers trained by the programme have implemented innovative improvements to secure OSH in</p> |

## 9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports

their home, villages and workplaces and numerous improvements in their life and work conditions.

2. Work improvement programmes have proven to be an effective entry point in reaching the informal economy. The programme encouraged partnerships among different stakeholders (government, workers' and employers' organisations and NGOs) to extend OSH protection to informal economy workers. Several trade unions and associations have strengthened their networks through the OSH training. They have used OSH training as an effective organizing strategy to organise informal workers from difficult-to-reach workplaces such as home-based enterprises and small unregistered construction sites. For example, through the training and their post-training contacts the Cambodian National Federation of Building and Wood Workers (CFBW) has organised more than 1800 construction workers in Phnom Penh and Kandal since last April and represent them in negotiations with the employer for better work conditions. Others like CUF, FBWW, CAID and IDEA have successfully organised ir Workers.

3) Partnership among different types of stakeholders in training and post-training follow-up visits are a key to success of the OSH course implementation. The programme mobilised 25 organisations/partners into action, bringing together different players from government (labour inspectors and extension workers), unions, employers and NGOs to disseminate OSH information in and extend protection to informal and hard-to-reach workplaces.

4. OSH initiatives which, from the beginning, were implemented at a micro level have progressively articulated with higher level efforts. Currently, the initiatives are widely recognised and are being integrated into the national OSH programme as a practical means to extend OSH protection to informal economy workplaces where the majority of Cambodian workers are actually working. This has also become a good example of positive interactions between policy and grassroots level efforts.

### **Lessons learned from the SKY insurance scheme.**

#### **From pilot initiative to national policy**

- Link to primary health care providers (using a payment mechanism to ensure costs containment and to enhance appropriate quality of care).
- Partnership with hospitals for more serious and expensive risks. The idea is to lift financial obstacles for users.
- Necessity of a clear and functioning referral system between the primary and secondary health facilities.
- The scheme serves as a model and an input to the Master Plan for Social Health Insurance in Cambodia. This is one clear example where policies and institutional schemes are built on pilot initiatives created within civil society partnership.
- Level of financial sustainability for a rural scheme of this model is US\$ 5 per person per year with a minimum coverage of 10,000 members.

#### **Developing Adequate Insurance Services for Poor Rural Households**

## 9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports

Rural households are usually not familiar with insurance services. To develop appropriate insurance products, GRET believes that specific communication methods must be developed to explain basic insurance principles and discuss insurance products with members. To ensure the participation of rural households in the insurance system, the project has developed the following methods:

- It uses focus groups and other participatory methods to know the opinion of members and improve the services proposed
- Insurance agents are living in the rural villages covered by the system; insurance must be a service close to people
- Insurance Consultative Committees are developed in villages. Such committees allow insured people to be informed on the project, provide feedback on insurance products and contribute to improving the overall system.

### **An Innovative Model for a Viable and Reproducible Insurance System**

The early stages of the experiment made it possible to verify the existence of strong demand among households for primary health care coverage beyond hospital care alone. Indeed, primary care is a daily preoccupation for households. With very limited resources, the insured wants a return on their insurance premiums all the more. Yet, given the population's limited ability to contribute, insurance systems tend to cover only hospital care first, leaving out primary care in order to be financially viable.

### **The Need for Strong Partnerships with Public Health Care Structures**

Quality of care and more generally the quality of services delivered are essential. Patients are not necessarily aware of the objective of the quality of medical care but only of its proximity, how they are received by staff, etc.

In order to guarantee this quality as well as transparent user fees, it is necessary to sign clear agreements with local health structures. In Cambodia, the government made the policy choice of creating health operational districts throughout the country with subsidized local health centres and a user fee system that is clear. Some public facilities also receive support from health NGOs, thus guaranteeing the minimum quality necessary for the health care to be used. Otherwise, if the quality is not acceptable, the insurance scheme will also not be attractive.

The challenge for the public sector is balancing access to care for the largest number at accessible rates while paying health staff attractive salaries. Developing an insurance system can contribute to financing health care structures. For this reason, health care facilities in Kandal and Takeo have been interested in building strong partnerships with GRET's insurance project.

### **Major design features of the GRET health (insurance scheme)**

- follows a community based approach
- targets rural and urban households with potential affordability

## 9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports

- has a clear social mission - be affordable for all including large and poor families
- is non-profit but must reach financial sustainability in the long-run after a subsidized period by external donors' funding
- is private and independent from health authorities or health providers, with aims to be managed by Cambodian managers with local insurance agents based in the village
- is designed in consultation with the direct beneficiaries in the villages
- is transparent in the scheme's financial management as its financial reports are presented in villages Health Insurance Consultative Committee (including elected insured representatives)
- covers both primary health care and hospital care with mandatory referral mechanism
  - o covers the whole members of the family (family membership required)
- works in partnership with public health facilities through capitation payment mechanism (health centre and district hospital levels) and case payments for most advanced care services (provincial and national hospital care levels) to enhance quality assurance and costs containment)
- works in partnership with Health authorities (MoH central and provincial level) and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Insurance) to fit into national health policy and guidelines and contribute to buildup the micro-insurance sector in Cambodia.

### **Cambodia:**

Under the IE project, it is found that when private sector combines with public agencies in testing innovations, one immediately has the advantage of flexibility to innovate, capacity to mobilize expertise in both domains, and the possibility of immediately institutionalizing within public spheres innovations that were found to work. In Cambodia, as stressed earlier, the road to development

### **Thailand**

The Ministry of Labour has been working on the implementation of the Ministerial Regulation on Homeworkers and the Ministerial Regulation on Agricultural Workers. It has been taking gradual steps with collecting information, extending the labour inspection and carrying out protection procedures to homeworkers and agricultural workers. The Ministry was quite overwhelmed with the load of work in implementing the regulations. Furthermore, how they may go about extending protection is not entirely clear. The IE Project supported these initiatives by funding some consultations and linking the Ministry with ILO experts. It can be said that during the life of the IE Project, the Ministry of Labor has been enriched with the regular inputs from the ILO specialists on the Labour Standard and good practices from various countries. In addition, the IE Project facilitated and contributed to the participation of the DLPW in international and regional seminars organized by ILO-DIALOGUE in Turin, Italy, and in Chennai, India, where various countries shared their experiences. Given its short duration, however, the project could not

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>9. Other relevant information in project's evaluation reports</b> |  |
|  | accompany the Ministry of Labour further in evolving appropriate strategies. |